CONTENTS

About the Series ............................................. xi
Acknowledgments ........................................... xii
Permissions ................................................... xiii
Preface by David W. Lesch ................................. xv
Chronology by David W. Lesch ............................ xix

Yes. The Algerian regime, after in effect annulling the 1992 parliamentary elections, precipitated a brutal civil war while undermining the democratic alternative in the region. (Bradford Dillman) .............................................. 2
No. The Islamist opposition may not have had the genuine support of the Algerian people. (Phillip C. Naylor) ....................... 6

Algerian Revolution: Were the military tactics employed by the French in the Algerian Revolution necessary? ......................... 11
Yes. French actions in the Algerian Revolution were part of a wider Western crusade against communism at the height of the Cold War, and whatever abuses that did occur were justified by the overarching goal. (Michael Peyron) .............................. 12
No. French conduct in the Algerian Revolution was a shameful attempt by a declining empire to maintain some semblance of influence. (Bradford Dillman) ........................................... 16

Yes. Given the nature of the Arab threat and the aggressive posture of Egyptian leader Gamal Abd al-Nasser, Israel was justified in its attack. (Antonio Donno) ................................. 21
No. Israel had wanted to acquire the West Bank and Gaza Strip since 1948, and it used the war rhetoric of Egyptian leader Gamal Abd al-Nasser as an excuse to launch a preemptive strike. (Ilan Pappe) ........................................ 24

Baghdad Pact: Could the Baghdad Pact have been successful? ........ 26
Yes. The Baghdad Pact could have played a significant role in regional affairs had the United States followed a different policy, beginning with active participation. (John M. VanderLippe) ........... 27
No. The Baghdad Pact was doomed from the beginning because of the failure in Washington and London to fully appreciate regional dynamics. (Daniele De Luca) ........................................ 30

Birth of Israel: Are the boundaries of Israel, which came into being as a result of the Arab-Israeli War of 1947–1949, legitimate? .......... 33
Yes. Israel comprises land acquired through legal purchases, owner abandonment, and the spoils of war. (Antonio Donno) ............. 35
No. The State of Israel includes lands acquired in violation of UN Resolution 181. (Ilan Pappe) ........................................ 37
Black September: Did Black September, the Jordanian Civil War, represent a victory for King Hussein? Yes. King Hussein asserted control over his country and ousted the Palestine Liberation Organization infrastructure that was a destabilizing influence in Jordan. (Jeffrey A. VanDenBerg)...

No. King Hussein of Jordan was a weak leader who had effectively abandoned the Palestinian cause, throwing in his lot with the West—and tacitly with Israel. (Husam Mohamad)...

Egyptian-Israeli Peace Treaty: Was the Egyptian-Israeli peace treaty of 1979 flawed? Yes. The Egyptian-Israeli peace treaty upset the Arab balance of power and cleared the path for Israel's invasion of Lebanon in 1982. (Glenn E. Perry)...

No. The Egyptian-Israeli peace treaty was a success because it provided the model for a diplomatic resolution to the Arab-Israeli conflict. (Antonio Donno)...

Eisenhower Doctrine: Did the Eisenhower Doctrine work? Yes. The Eisenhower Doctrine was a legitimate alternative to the Baghdad Pact, and it was successfully applied in Jordan in 1957 and Lebanon in 1958. (Antonio Donno)...

No. The Eisenhower Doctrine was a misapplied globalist policy that cast the United States in the position of taking over where the British and French had failed. (Daniele De Luca)...

Free Officers Revolution: Did the Free Officers Revolution of 1952 in Egypt signal revolutionary social change? Yes. The Free Officers Revolution was organized by a younger generation of Arabs frustrated by the inability of the older generation to deliver true independence and socio-economic justice. (Daniele De Luca)...

No. The Free Officers Revolution signaled the coming to power of a military dictatorship that imposed another form of authoritarianism. (Arthur Goldschmidt)...

Gulf War 1991: Entry: Did the United States enter the Persian Gulf War to deter Iraq from developing weapons of mass destruction? Yes. The United States entered the Persian Gulf War primarily to oppose military aggression against Kuwait and to halt the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction. (Gerald Steinberg)...

No. The United States entered the Persian Gulf War for less-than-altruistic reasons, including the protection of oil and business investments. (Jim Ross-Nazzal)...

Gulf War 1991: Exit: Was the Bush administration wise to terminate the Persian Gulf War before forcibly ousting Saddam Hussein? Yes. If coalition forces had gone further into Iraq, international support for the war effort would have dissipated, negating chances for the Madrid peace process and leading to a heavy U.S. investment in lives and matériel. (David W. Lesch)...

No. The United States ended the Persian Gulf War (1990–1991) prematurely; it should have removed Saddam Hussein from power when it had the opportunity to do so with broad international support. (Abbas Mehdi)...

Intifada 1987–1993: Was the Palestinian intifada of 1987–1993 a spontaneous uprising in the Occupied Territories? Yes. The intifada of 1987–1993 was a result of Palestinian frustration with the failed leadership of the Palestine Liberation Organization. (Jim Ross-Nazzal)
No. The intifada of 1987–1993 was a long-simmering intensification of existing animosity toward Israeli policies in the Occupied Territories. (Glenn E. Robinson) ......................................................... 93

Iran-Iraq War: Did Iraqi leader Saddam Hussein attack Iran in 1980 in order to achieve domination in the Persian Gulf region? ........... 97
Yes. With the overthrow of the Shah in Iran and the decline of Egyptian influence, Saddam Hussein saw an opportunity to fill the power vacuum in the Arab world. (Shak Hanish) ......................... 98
No. Saddam Hussein attacked for defensive reasons, because he feared that Iran was intent on exporting its Revolution. (David W. Lesch) ............................................................... 101

Iranian Revolution: Did the 1977–1979 Revolution in Iran rid the country of a repressive tyrant? ................................. 106
Yes. Despite the negative publicity the Revolution received, it was mostly a positive development that set the stage for a democratic society in Iran. (Ali Abootalebi) ........................................ 107
No. The Revolution led to an even more repressive regime coming to power that had a negative impact on Iran over the long term. (Valentina Vantaggio) ........................................ 111

Iraqi Revolution: Was the Iraqi Revolution of 1958 a step forward in the political development of Iraq? .............................. 116
Yes. The Iraqi Revolution expanded the political base in Iraq, removing the ancien régime and opening the door for independent socio-economic development. (Shak Hanish) ............ 117
No. The Iraqi Revolution was a violent event that established a precedent for future political developments in the country. (Sir Samuel Falle) ........................................................ 120

Israel in Lebanon: Was the failure of Israel’s Peace for Galilee campaign in 1982 a result of the attempt to install a government in Beirut friendly to the Jewish state? ......................... 126
Yes. Once invading Israeli military forces moved beyond PLO strongholds and occupied Beirut, Syrian opposition in Lebanon stiffened, public support in Israel weakened, and Israeli casualties rose to intolerable levels. (Eyal Zisser) .................. 127
No. The hard-line policy of destroying the PLO, adopted by the Likud Party when it came to power in 1977, was doomed from the start, causing moderate Islamic leaders to be replaced by militants determined to resist Israeli threats at all costs. (Ilan Pappe) .......... 131

Israeli Victory in 1967: Was the outcome of the Arab-Israeli War of 1967 an unmitigated triumph for Israel? ......................... 134
Yes. Victory in the 1967 War secured Israel’s presence in the region and gave it bargaining leverage with neighboring Arab countries. (Paola Olimpo) ........................................ 135
No. Victory in the 1967 War created many problems for the State of Israel, such as the issue of Palestinian refugees and security in the Occupied Territories. (Ilan Pappe) ......................................... 137

League of Arab States: Has the League of Arab States been a successful organization? .................................................. 141
Yes. The League of Arab States has been a relatively effective regional organization, helping to unify the Arab world. (Eyal Zisser) ................................................ 142
No. The League of Arab States is more of a sign of Arab disunity than unity, as it is a loose coalition of independent states that have acted separately on many occasions. (Elie Podeh) ......................... 146

Multinational Force in Lebanon: Was the Multinational Force (MNF) in Lebanon a success? ..................................... 148
Partly. The first contingent of the MNF achieved its objective of escorting the Palestine Liberation Organization out of Beirut,
but the second contingent failed to help the Lebanese
government restore its authority. (Valentina Vantaggio) 149

No. The MNF was a total failure because it had no autonomous
political authority, the troop contingents were too small to be
effective, and none of the combatants was willing to respect the
cease-fire. (Antonio Donno) 152

Musaddiq Coup: Did the United States and Great Britain make a
mistake in orchestrating the overthrow of Iranian prime minister
Muhammad Musaddiq in 1953? 156

Yes. The coup removed opposition to the repressive regime of
the Shah and thus presaged the Iranian Revolution of 1979.
(James Goode) 157

No. The coup was necessary given the Cold War environment
and the genuine threat of Mohammad Musaddiq succumbing to
communist control in such a vital geostrategic region.
(Sir Samuel Falle) 160

NSC 5820/1: Was the National Security Council (NSC) directive
5820/1 of November 1958 a positive policy shift for the
Eisenhower administration? 165

Yes. Recognizing the influence of Arab nationalism, the Eisenhower
administration began a process, culminated during the Kennedy
administration, of working with Arab nationalists against the
spread of communism in the region. (Paola Olimpo) 166

No. NSC 5820/1 represented a step backward in U.S. Middle
Eastern policy because the Eisenhower administration did not
differentiate between communism and Arab nationalism and
failed to contain radical Arabs and their demands on Israel.
(Daniele De Luca) 168

Oil Production: Were the multinational oil companies needlessly
exploitative in developing the Middle Eastern oil fields? 172

Yes. The deals engineered by the multinational oil companies
sowed the seeds of the OPEC-led revolt against corporate
control and the oil crises of the 1970s. (Valentina Vantaggio) 173

No. The multinational oil companies successfully introduced Middle
Eastern oil into the world market without lowering prices or sparking
corporate battles over market shares. (E. Peter Fitzgerald) 176

Oslo Accords: Were the Oslo accords signed by the Israelis and
Palestinians in 1993 successful? 182

Yes. The Oslo accords were a success because they
established a process for Israeli and Palestinian negotiations and
established a timetable for resolving their differences.
(Jim Ross-Nazzal) 183

No. The Oslo accords were a failure because they were based
on a phased approach and did not properly establish a vision
of a final peace. (Glenn E. Robinson) 187

Palestine Liberation Organization: Has the Palestine Liberation
Organization been an effective representative of the
Palestinian people? 193

Yes. The PLO has been and is a legitimate, necessary, and largely
successful representative of the Palestinian people that has
gone far beyond its original mandate. (JoAnn A. DiGeorgio-Lutz) 194

No. The PLO was hastily formed, and it is inherently incapable of
decisive action because of its splintered development and
vulnerability to external influence. (Kenneth Hendrickson) 199

Point Four Program: Did Harry S Truman’s Point Four Program in
the Middle East have a realistic chance of success? 202

Yes. Point Four was a well-intended program that would have
been successful in the Middle East if given the necessary
support and time to develop. (Paola Olimpo) 203
No. Point Four was a mismanaged and idealistic program that had little chance of succeeding amid the heightened tension of the Cold War and regional developments. (Paul W. T. Kingston) 205


Yes. The fact that UN Security Council Resolution 242 is still operative today is a testimony to its effectiveness as a framework for peace between Israel and the Arab states. (Eyal Zisser) 212

No. The ambiguous passages used in UN Security Council Resolution 242 have damaged the peace process by allowing the parties involved to interpret the document differently. (Paola Olimpo) 214

Sadat's Trip to Israel: Was Egyptian president Anwar Sadat's trip to Israel in 1977 his "greatest triumph," as he proclaimed? 219

Yes. Sadat's trip to Israel was a necessary strategic move that helped reactivate the peace process. (Paola Olimpo) 220

Yes. However, the full significance of Sadat's trip to Israel can only be properly understood in the context of his 1973 decision to go to war with Israel. (Jack Kalpakian) 223

No. Sadat's trip to Israel was a desperate gamble that placed the Egyptian leader immediately in a vulnerable bargaining position. (Daniele De Luca) 225

Shah of Iran: Could the Shah of Iran have forestalled the Iranian Revolution of 1977-1979? 228

Yes. The Shah of Iran could have stayed in power had he won the support of the bazaaris (small merchants) and the clergy and promoted democratization. (Valentina Vantaggio) 229

No. The Shah of Iran's ouster was inevitable because of his ambivalent policy toward protesters and the charisma of Ayatollah Ruhollah Khomeini. (Galia Vitali) 233

Sinai I and II: Did the disengagement agreements known as Sinai I (1974) and Sinai II (1975) facilitate the Arab-Israeli peace process? 237

Yes. The step-by-step approach that led to Sinai I and Sinai II was the correct diplomatic methodology at the time, because it gave incentives to the Arabs and the Israelis to continue the peace process. (Eyal Zisser) 238

No. Sinai I and Sinai II were interim agreements that failed to deal comprehensively with the larger Arab-Israeli dispute. (James Stone) 240

Suez War: Was the Eisenhower administration justified in opposing the tripartite invasion of Egypt in 1956? 244

Yes. By opposing the tripartite invasion, the United States avoided appearing imperialistic and preserved its influential position in the Arab world. (Glenn E. Perry) 245

No. The United States should have been supportive of the tripartite invasion, since it served to undermine Egyptian leader Gamal Abd al-Nasser. (Daniele De Luca) 249

Superpower Cold War: Did the superpowers inflame regional conflict in the Middle East during the Cold War? 252

Yes. The United States and the Soviet Union contributed to heightened tensions in the Middle East by supporting competing sides with military and economic aid. (Robert O. Freedman) 253

No. The Cold War actually dampened regional conflict in the Middle East as the opposing influences of the United States and the Soviet Union served to create a balance of power that often stabilized the area. (Carol R. Saivetz) 255
Syrian-Israeli Negotiations: Did the Syrian-Israeli peace negotiations in the 1990s have a chance of producing a peace agreement? 

Yes. The Syrian-Israeli negotiations in the 1990s could have produced a peace agreement if the Israelis had adhered to a consistent policy and the Syrians had been more flexible on procedural issues. *(Najib Ghadbian)* 

No. Although some progress was made on the technical details of a peace agreement, the Syrians and Israelis were doomed to failure by their mutual suspicion and animosity. *(Eyal Zisser)* 

United Arab Republic: Did the United Arab Republic (1958–1961) fail because of mistakes by Gamal Abd al-Nasser? 

Yes. Egyptian president Gamal Abd al-Nasser’s reluctance to share power undermined popular support for the United Arab Republic. *(Paola Olimpo)* 

No. The failure of the United Arab Republic was largely the result of the unrealistic expectations of Arab nationalists. *(Arthur Goldschmidt)* 


References .................................................. 311

Contributors .................................................. 319

Index .................................................. 321